# CITY OF ST. LOUIS CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES JUNE 27, 2011

## **BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT**

Richard Callow, Chairman Michael Killeen David Richardson Anthony Robinson Alderman Gregory Carter

## **CULTURAL RESOURCES STAFF PRESENT**

Betsy H. Bradley, Director Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

Board member Michael Killeen moved to approve the current agenda. Alderman Gregory Carter seconded the motion. The current agenda was approved.

#### **SPECIAL AGENDA ITEM**

Presentation on current practices in other municipalities for the regulation of solar panels in Historic Districts.

#### PROCEEDINGS:

Betsy Bradley presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating solar panel installations in Historic Districts within numerous cities around the country. Her presentation highlighted three approaches to finding a balance for installing, regulating and/or approving solar panels in St. Louis Historic Districts. Ms. Bradley's presentation included:

- 1. Traditional Approach-Must not be visible
- 2. Moderate Approach-Limited Visibility; and
- 3. Supportive Approach-Must have Adverse Effect to Deny. She concluded her presentation by suggesting that the Preservation Board members consider the approaches she outlined and the images she presented in preparation of a discussion of how to proceed with this topic. The Chairman

suggested that the regulation of solar panels be discussed at the next Board Meeting.

#### PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

| Α.       | 2011.0918 | 1710 CARROLL STREET  | LAFAYETTE SQUARE HISTORIC DISTRIC |
|----------|-----------|----------------------|-----------------------------------|
| <i>_</i> | -011.0310 | IT IO CANNOLL STREET | LAI ATETTE SQUARE HISTORIC DISTRI |

Owner/Applicant: Diversified Real Estate Group-John Muller

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary Review to construct a single-family dwelling on a

vacant lot.

PROCEEDINGS: Jan Cameron presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the

site and surrounding area. She recommended that the

Preservation Board grant preliminary approval to the project concept, and that the Board direct the developer to continue to work with the Cultural Resources Office staff to refine elements and details of the design. Ms. Cameron stated that the proposal appears to comply with the existing District Standards. She stated that the Lafayette Square Restoration Group requested that his new design follow a Historic Model Example, which will be

required in the district's revised historic standards document that is nearly ready for the Board's consideration. The owner agreed to

this and submitted a Model Example.

John Muller of Diversified Real Estate Group testified on his own behalf. He stated that he is willing to refine the details of this design with the Cultural Resources staff.

Keith Houghton of the Lafayette Square Restoration Group testified in support of the project.

FINDINGS OF FACT:

The Preservation Board found that the design complies with the current historic district standards, with the exception of the following:

- a.) the sizes of the openings on the front elevation do not follow the Model Example submitted;
- b.) the height of the cornice does not reflect that of the Model Example; and
- c.) the east elevation, facing Dolman Street, is a Public Façade under the definition in the Ordinance which requires that openings comprise a minimum of 25% of the wall surface. There are currently no openings proposed for this elevation.

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary

approval of the project concept with the condition that Mr. Muller

work with the Cultural Resources Office staff to refine the elements including but not limited to the windows of the front façade and the proportions thereof, as well as requiring windows on the east elevation in accordance with the Lafayette Square Code. The motion was made by Board Member Richardson and seconded by Alderman Carter. The motion passed unanimously.

B. 2011.0978 800, 802 & 804 ANN SOULARD HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Kevin King

Applicant: Johnson Architectural Services- Laura Johnson

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary Review to construct three (3) attached houses on a

vacant lot.

PROCEEDINGS: Jan Cameron presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the

site and surrounding area. At the request of the Cultural Resources Office staff, the architect revised the slope of the buildings' roofs and has explored ways of screening the desired pre-fabricated egress windows on the front elevations to blend them into the fabric of the historic street. The staff believed that those changes will satisfy the requirements of the Soulard Historic District Standards for new

construction.

Ms. Cameron recommended that the Preservation Board grant preliminary approval with the stipulation that final construction documents and exterior materials are reviewed and approved by the

Cultural Resources Office staff.

She submitted into the record letters from the Soulard Restoration Group in support of the project with stipulations and a letter from Alderwoman Phyllis Young in support of the project.

Laura Johnson of Johnson Architectural Services and Kevin King, owner of the property, testified on behalf of the project. Ms. Johnson showed drawings of the revisions to the width of the balcony and appearance of the balcony door on the center building as mentioned by the LSRG.

FINDINGS OF FACT: The Preservation Board found that:

a.) the three proposed buildings comply with the Soulard

Historic District Standards;

b.) solar panels are not addressed under the current standards;

and

c.) the panels will not be visible from any street within the district, only from the alley. They will be slightly visible from S. 7<sup>th</sup> Street,

which is outside the historic district boundaries.

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary

approval to the project as submitted subject to the revised design of the French door and to grant a variance for the solar panels on the rear roof slope, as the panels are not visible from the street. The motion was made by Board Member Michael Killeen. Mr.

Richardson seconded the motion. The motion passed

unanimously.

#### **APPEAL OF STAFF DENIAL**

| C. 2011.0803 1828 HICKORY ST. LAFAYETTE SQUARE HISTORIC | C DISTRICT |
|---|------------|
|---|------------|

Owners: Michael P. & Joan M. Gerard
Applicant: Renewal By Andersen – Jim Neal

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of a staff denial of a building permit application to replace

seventeen (17) windows on the public façade.

PROCEEDINGS: Andrea Gagen presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating

the site and surrounding area. She submitted into the record Ordinances #64689, #62232, and the agenda. She stated that the proposed windows are a composite material called "FiberX". Ms. Gagen also stated that Ward 6 Alderwoman Kacie Starr Triplett sent an email expressing her support for the project. Ms. Gagen recommended that the Preservation Board uphold the staff's denial as the proposed windows do not meet the Lafayette Square Historic District standards, which allow only wood

components for windows at Public Facades.

Michael Gerard, property owner testified on his own behalf. He stated that the proposed windows look, feel and act like wood and are composed of a combination of wood and resin that is not

# PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES JUNE 27, 2011 Page 5 of 5

vinyl. He proposed the use of these windows to meet energy conservation goals and to reduce maintenance.

Jim Neal, operations manager and contractor testified in support of the project. He submitted into the record material samples of the windows proposed to be installed. Mr. Neal stated that the materials are a composite material mixed with wood fiber.

Keith Houghton of the Lafayette Square Restoration Group testified as a citizen in support of the project.

#### FINDINGS OF FACT:

The Preservation Board found that:

- a.) the property is located in the Lafayette Square Local Historic District;
- b.) the project was reviewed under the criteria of Ordinance 62232, 203 Windows, 203.1 Windows At Public Facades;
- c.) the current windows are aluminum; and
- d.) the Lafayette Square Historic District standards require windows with only wood components at the Public Facade.

#### ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the staff's denial and grant approval for a building permit for the proposed windows with the stipulation that the final details and dimensions of the windows be worked out with the Cultural Resources Office staff. The motion was made by Board Member Michael Killeen and seconded by Mr. Robinson. The motion passed unanimously.

A motion to approve the minutes of the May 23, 2011 meeting was made by Board Member Dave Richardson and seconded by Chairman Callow.

A motion to adjourn the meeting was made by Alderman Gregory Carter. Hearing no objection, the meeting adjourned.